# Metadata of the article that will be visualized in OnlineFirst

| ArticleTitle                | Prospects of a tether sys  | tem deployed at the L1 libration point   |
|-----------------------------|--|--|
| Article Sub-Title           |  |  |
| Article CopyRight           | The Author(s), under exclusive licence to Springer Nature B.V.<br>(This will be the copyright line in the final PDF)   |  |
| Journal Name                | Nonlinear Dynamics   |  |
| Corresponding Author        | Family Name  | Aslanov  |
|                             | Particle   |  |
|                             | Given Name   | Vladimir S.  |
|                             | Suffix   |  |
|                             | Division   |  |
|                             | Organization   | Samara National Research University  |
|                             | Address  | 34, Moscovskoe shosse, Samara, Russia, 443086  |
|                             | Phone  |  |
|                             | Fax  |  |
|                             | Email  | aslanov_vs@mail.ru   |
|                             | URL  | http://aslanov.ssau.ru/  |
|                             | ORCID  | http://orcid.org/0000-0003-4065-137X   |
|                             | Received   | 5 April 2021   |
| Schedule                    | Revised  | ·  |
|                             | Accepted   | 2 September 2021   |
| Abstract                    | The paper focuses on the<br>of a tether system in the<br>example of the Mars-Ph<br>the L1 libration point an<br>Nechville variables are of<br>tether is inextensible and<br>are integrated in quadrat<br>As a result of eccentricit<br>angular velocity equal to<br>connecting them. A new<br>deployment to the upper<br>stable position, and main<br>equipment of this tether<br>shown the effectiveness<br>the Mars-Phobos system<br>3.4 km). This paper is th<br>with a tether system "att<br>control laws and the seq<br>future missions through | e study and development of a mission to use the L1 libration point for deployment<br>direction of a moon in the planar elliptic restricted three-body problem on the<br>obos system. An orbiting spacecraft, which deploys the tether system, is located at<br>d is held at this point by the low thrust of its engines. The classical equations in the<br>converted into equations in polar coordinates and, for the particular case when the<br>d two primaries moving in circular orbits about their mass center. These equations<br>ture, and the equilibrium positions and the oscillation period of the tether are found.<br>ty, the primaries move on ellipses around the barycenter, which rotates with<br>to that of the primaries, the position of the two-body pulsates along the axis<br>mission architecture is proposed, which includes three successive stages: initial<br>pulsation point (perigee), angular stabilization of the tether relative to the lower<br>ntaining a constant distance to a moon's surface. An end mass with measuring<br>system can be set directly on the moon's surface. Numerical simulations have<br>of the proposed control laws of the tether system at all stages of the mission for<br>h, in which the L1 libration point is located quite close to the Phobos' surface (~<br>he first effort, using to justify publicly the possibility of implementing a mission<br>tached'' at L1 libration point to study surface of moons based on the proposed<br>uence of their application. The results of this study can be used to enable many<br>out the solar system. If in the future similar missions will be approved, then<br>preed control methods of this kind of systems will be developed |
| Keywords (separated by '-') | L1 libration point - Teth  | er system - Stability and instability - Exact solutions - Control laws   |
| Footnote Information        |  |  |



4 Vladimir S. Aslanov

5 Received: 5 April 2021 / Accepted: 2 September 2021
6 © The Author(s), under exclusive licence to Springer Nature B.V. 2021

7 Abstract The paper focuses on the study and 8 development of a mission to use the L1 libration point 9 for deployment of a tether system in the direction of a 10 moon in the planar elliptic restricted three-body 1 Aq1 problem on the example of the Mars-Phobos system. 12 An orbiting spacecraft, which deploys the tether 13 system, is located at the L1 libration point and is held 14 at this point by the low thrust of its engines. The 15 classical equations in the Nechville variables are converted into equations in polar coordinates and, for 16 17 the particular case when the tether is inextensible and 18 two primaries moving in circular orbits about their 19 mass center. These equations are integrated in quadra-20 ture, and the equilibrium positions and the oscillation 21 period of the tether are found. As a result of 22 eccentricity, the primaries move on ellipses around 23 the barycenter, which rotates with angular velocity 24 equal to that of the primaries, the position of the two-25 body pulsates along the axis connecting them. A new 26 mission architecture is proposed, which includes three 27 successive stages: initial deployment to the upper 28 pulsation point (perigee), angular stabilization of the 29 tether relative to the lower stable position, and 30 maintaining a constant distance to a moon's surface. 31 An end mass with measuring equipment of this tether

A1 V. S. Aslanov (🖂)

A5 URL: http://aslanov.ssau.ru/

system can be set directly on the moon's surface. 32 Numerical simulations have shown the effectiveness 33 of the proposed control laws of the tether system at all 34 stages of the mission for the Mars-Phobos system, in 35 which the L1 libration point is located quite close to 36 the Phobos' surface ( $\sim 3.4$  km). This paper is the first 37 effort, using to justify publicly the possibility of 38 implementing a mission with a tether system "at-39 tached" at L1 libration point to study surface of moons 40 based on the proposed control laws and the sequence 41 of their application. The results of this study can be 42 used to enable many future missions throughout the 43 solar system. If in the future similar missions will be 44 approved, then undoubtedly more advanced control 45 methods of this kind of systems will be developed. 46

KeywordsL1 libration point · Tether system ·47Stability and instability · Exact solutions · Control48laws49

#### **1** Introduction

The field of space tethers has received very much51attention in recent decades, with several books [1–4]52and many papers (eg. [5–18]) available in the scientific53literature. The fundamental book by Beletsky and54Levin [1] has played an important role in providing the55basis for the study of the space tethered system56

Deringer

50



| Journal : Medium 11071      | Dispatch : 9-9-2021 | Pages : 13 |
|-----------------------------|---------------------|------------|
| Article No. : 6884          | 🗆 LE                | □ TYPESET  |
| MS Code : NODY-D-21-00862R1 | 🖌 СР                | 🗹 disk     |



A2 Samara National Research University, 34, Moscovskoe

A3 shosse, Samara, Russia 443086

A4 e-mail: aslanov\_vs@mail.ru

57 dynamics. The advent of space tether systems starts a 58 new era in space research. The tether systems can emerge as a new technology for developing the planets 59 60 of the solar system, their moons [16], and the exploitation of other celestial bodies, as well as 61 62 asteroids [14]. In cases of the study of the tether 63 dynamics in the gravitational fields of two bodies, one 64 cannot do without considering the three-body prob-65 lem, as for example [16]. The restricted three-body problem is the foundation for solving many applied 66 67 problems of astronautics, in particular, for the com-68 putation of interplanetary flights. A detailed analysis 69 of main studies on this topic can be found in the 70 Szebehely's textbook [19], which discusses a variety 71 of motion states, equilibrium positions, motion near 72 these positions, application of Hamiltonian dynamics 73 methods to the restricted problem, its periodic orbits, 74 and other aspects. Currently, a large number of papers 75 on the restricted three-body problem have been 76 published (e.g., [20-25]), in which this problem is 77 studied in detail, and these results are widely used in 78 various astronautical missions. It should be pointed 79 out here that the above references are not an exhaus-80 tive analysis of the literature on the topic in question, 81 which is very extensive and includes a huge number of 82 works, but they do provide some insight into the 83 AQ2 problem.

84 In 2017, NASA proposed an innovative mission 85 architecture to explore the surface of Phobos utilizing a tether system "anchored" at the L1 libration point 86 87 [16]. As a release point of the tether, it was proposed to 88 use an orbiting spacecraft, which should hover in the 89 vicinity of the L1 libration point of the Mars-Phobos 90 system. This mission was called Phobos L1 Operational Tether Experiment (PHLOTE). Kempton, Pear-91 92 son, Levin, Carroll, and Amzajerdian have 93 investigated the key technical challenges associated 94 with implementing the PHLOTE mission at the Mars-95 Phobos L1 libration point location. PHLOTE deploy-96 ment dynamics has been simulated in the first 97 approximation, and a set of suitable deployment 98 trajectories has been identified. After deployment, 99 the tether reel control damps residual longitudinal and lateral oscillations by periodically reeling a short 100 segment of the tether in and out, based on the 101 102 measurements of some parameters. However, the 103 stabilization effect is achieved in a very particular 104 region in the parameter space. This PHLOTE initial study provides a compelling example that many future 105

V. S. Aslanov

missions throughout the solar system can use. Obvi-106 ously, the new engineering ideas require solutions of 107 new fundamental problems. The PHLOTE report [16] 108 has provided many of the hardware solutions, techni-109 cal details needed to implement the mission. Never-110 theless, such a complex innovative mission requires an 111 additional theoretical substantiation and a possible 112 multiplicity of analytical models of the system motion 113 and control laws of the tether system. 114

The paper focuses on the study and development of 115 a mission similar to the PHLOTE mission, in which 116 the L1 libration point is used to deploy the tether 117 system in the direction of the moon. An orbiting 118 spacecraft, further referred to simply as the orbiter, 119 which deploys the tether system, is located at the L1 120 libration point and is held at this point by the low thrust 121 of its engines. The goal of the paper is to study the 122 behavior of the system and develop control of the 123 deployment and stabilization of the tether system at a 124 certain distance from a moon's surface of the L1-moon 125 mission. The proposed mission includes three succes-126 sive stages: initial deployment from the L1 libration 127 point to the upper pulsation point (perigee), angular 128 stabilization of the tether relative to the lower 129 stable position, and maintaining a constant distance 130 to the moon's surface. The last stage is related to an 131 eccentricity, since due to it the primaries move on 132 ellipses around the barycenter, which rotates with 133 angular velocity equal to that of the primaries, the 134 position of the two-body pulsates along the axis 135 connecting them. This paper is not directed at 136 developing control algorithms for similar tether sys-137 tems in detail. It is the first effort, using to justify 138 publicly the possibility of implementing a mission 139 with a tether system "attached" at the L1 libration 140 point to study surface of moons. It is based on the 141 proposed control laws and the sequence of their 142 application. 143

Initially, in terms of the planar restricted three-body 144 problem, the motion equations are written in the 145 rotating Cartesian coordinate system in Nechville 146 variables and these equations are then converted to 147 dimensionless equations in polar coordinates relative 148 to the L1 libration point. Next, for the particular case 149 when the tether is inextensible and the primaries move 150 on circular paths around the barycenter of the system, 151 these equations are integrated in quadrature, the 152 equilibrium positions and the oscillation period of 153 the tether are found. The proposed control laws of the 154

🖄 Springer



| Journal : Medium 11071      | Dispatch : 9-9-2021 | Pages : 13 |
|-----------------------------|---------------------|------------|
| Article No. : 6884          | □ LE                | □ TYPESET  |
| MS Code : NODY-D-21-00862R1 | 🗹 СР                | 🖌 disk     |

155 tether system at the first stage provide the initial (basic) deployment, at the second stage ensures 156 stabilization of the tether relative to the lower 157 158 stable position of equilibrium closest to the moon's 159 surface, and the last stage realizes control of deploy-160 ment and retrieval of the tether due to pulsating 161 motions of the L1 libration point caused by the eccentricity of the primaries orbits. As an example, the 162 163 Mars-Phobos system is considered, in which the L1 164 libration point is located quite close to the Phobos' 165 surface ( $\sim$  3.4 km). And if necessary, a measuring equipment can be set on end mass of this tether system 166 167 directly on the moon's surface. The numerical simulations have shown the effectiveness of the proposed 168 control laws of the tether system at all stages of the 169 170 mission for the Mars-Phobos system. And finally, conclusions about the feasibility of the implementa-171 172 tion of the suggested mission and features of the 173 behavior of the tether system using the proposed 174 control laws are made.

## 175 2 Dimensionless equations of motion in polar 176 coordinates relative to L1 libration point

177 In this section, we derive the planar motion equations 178 of a small body M in two gravitational fields of two 179 primaries  $M_1$  and  $M_2$  (Planet-Moon) in polar coordi-180 nates relative to the  $L_1$  libration point in terms of the 181 classical elliptic three-body problem [19, 26]. It is 182 assumed that the mass of the body M is many times 183 less than the mass of the bodies  $M_1$  and  $M_2$ . Therefore, 184 the body *M* has negligible effect on the other bodies. It 185 is also supposed that the bodies  $M_1$  and  $M_2$  move in 186 elliptical orbits around their mutual mass center. The distance between the two primaries is 187

$$r = \frac{p}{1 + e\cos f} \tag{1}$$

189 where p is the semilatus rectum, e is the eccentricity of 190 the two-body orbit of the primaries, and f is the true 191 anomaly. The orbiter is located at the L1 libration 192 point, which is the attachment point for the tether 193 system, as it will be discussed further. In the barycen-194 tre-centered synodic coordinate system, which rotates 195 with the two primaries and using Nechvile's variables 196  $(\xi, \eta)$ , the small body's motion can be described in 197 dimensionless form as [19, 26]

$$\xi'' - 2\eta' = \frac{1}{1 + e\cos f} \frac{\partial\Omega}{\partial\xi} \tag{2}$$

$$\eta'' + 2\xi' = \frac{1}{1 + e\cos f} \frac{\partial\Omega}{\partial\eta}$$
(3)

where  $\Omega$  is the potential function given by

$$\Omega = \frac{1}{2} \left( \xi^2 + \eta^2 \right) + \frac{1 - \mu}{r_1} + \frac{\mu}{r_2} \quad \left( 0 < \mu \le \frac{1}{2} \right) \tag{4}$$

$$r_1 = \sqrt{(\xi + \mu)^2 + \eta^2} \quad r_2 = \sqrt{(\xi + \mu - 1)^2 + \eta^2} \quad (5)$$

where  $(.)' = \frac{d}{d_f}(.)$  and  $(.)'' = \frac{d^2}{d_{f^2}}(.)$ ;  $\mu = \frac{m_2}{m_1 + m_2}$  is the 205 mass ratio;  $m_1$  and  $m_2$  are masses of the bodies  $M_1$  and 206  $M_2$ , respectively. 207

The coordinates  $\xi$  for the collinear libration points208 $(L_1, L_2 \text{ and } L_3)$  can be determined in terms of the mass209ratio  $\mu$  as the roots of the following equation [26]210

$$\xi - \mu \frac{|\mu + \xi - 1|}{(\mu + \xi - 1)^3} - (1 - \mu) \frac{|\mu + \xi|}{(\mu + \xi)^3} = 0$$
(6)

Next, to determine the coordinate of the  $L_1$  libration212point, we use the well-known approximate formula. It213is possible to find a more exact formula, but this does214not change the essence, since this coordinate depends215only on the unchanging mass ratio  $\mu$ 216

$$\xi_1 = 1 - \left(\frac{\mu}{3}\right)^{1/3} = \sigma$$
 (7)

Position of the body M relative to the  $L_1$  libration218points in a polar reference frame  $(l, \alpha)$  is defined by219substituting the variables220

$$\xi = \sigma + lk \cos \alpha, \ \eta = lk \sin \alpha \tag{8}$$

where  $k = 1 + e \cos f$ ,  $l = \frac{L}{p}$  is the dimensionless 222 distance, *L* is the distance between the small body 223 and the L1 libration point, or in this case, tether length. 224

Eqs. motion (2) and (3) in the polar reference frame225(Fig. 1) are written as226

$$\alpha'' + F_{\alpha} = 0 \tag{9}$$

201

Deringer



| Journal : Medium 11071      | Dispatch : 9-9-2021 | Pages : 13 |
|-----------------------------|---------------------|------------|
| Article No. : 6884          | 🗆 LE                | TYPESET    |
| MS Code : NODY-D-21-00862R1 | 🗹 СР                | 🗹 DISK     |

235



**Fig. 1** The polar frame  $(L, \alpha)$ 

 $l'' + F_l = 0$ 

230 where

$$F_{\alpha} = -\left[\frac{2(1+\alpha')(el\sin f - kl')}{lk} - \frac{\sigma\sin\alpha}{lk^{2}} + \frac{\mu(\mu - 1 + \sigma)\sin\alpha}{lk^{2}((\mu - 1 + \sigma)^{2} + kl(2(\mu - 1 + \sigma)\cos\alpha + kl))^{3/2}} - \frac{(-1+\mu)(\mu + \sigma)\sin\alpha}{lk^{2}((\mu + \sigma)^{2} + kl(2(\mu + \sigma)\cos\alpha + kl))^{3/2}}\right]$$
(11)

(10)

232  

$$F_{l} = -\left[\frac{2el'\sin f}{k} + (1+\alpha')^{2}l + \frac{\sigma\cos\alpha}{k^{2}} - \frac{\mu((\mu-1+\sigma)\cos\alpha+kl)}{k^{2}\left((\mu-1+\sigma)^{2} + kl(2(\mu-1+\sigma)\cos\alpha+kl)\right)^{3/2}} + \frac{(-1+\mu)((\mu+\sigma)\cos\alpha+kl)}{k^{2}\left((\mu+\sigma)^{2} + kl(2(\mu+\sigma)\cos\alpha+kl)\right)^{3/2}}\right]$$
(12)

234

🖉 Springer



| Journal : Medium 11071      | Dispatch : 9-9-2021 | Pages : 13 |
|-----------------------------|---------------------|------------|
| Article No. : 6884          | □ LE                | □ TYPESET  |
| MS Code : NODY-D-21-00862R1 | 🗹 СР                | 🖌 disk     |

#### **3** Constant-length tether

A better understanding of the tether motion in the twobody gravitational field in terms of the restricted threebody problem can be achieved by considering the simple case when a weightless and inextensible tether with an end body is attached to the  $L_1$  libration point. In this case, Eq. (9) describes the oscillation of a material point on an inextensible tether 236 237 238 239 240 241 241 242

$$L = \text{const} \to l = \text{const} \tag{13}$$

This helps to determine equilibrium positions, to244find a period of oscillations and to identify some other245regularities of motion of a peculiar pendulum in the246two-body gravitational field. If condition (13) is247satisfied, the motion of the end body M is described248by only one differential equation (9) as follows249

$$\alpha'' = \frac{2e(1+\alpha')\sin f}{k} - \frac{\sigma\sin\alpha}{k^{2}l} + \frac{\mu(\mu-1+\sigma)\sin\alpha}{k^{2}l\left((\mu-1+\sigma)^{2} + kl(2(\mu-1+\sigma)\cos\alpha+kl)\right)^{3/2}} - \frac{(-1+\mu)(\mu+\sigma)\sin\alpha}{k^{2}l\left((\mu+\sigma)^{2} + kl(2(\mu+\sigma)\cos\alpha+kl)\right)^{3/2}}$$
(14)

If two primaries move in circular orbits (e = 0, 251  $k = 1 + e \cos f = 1$ ), then Eq. (14) takes the form 252

$$\alpha'' + F(\alpha) = 0 \tag{15}$$

where the dimensionless generalized force is written as 254

$$F(\alpha) = \frac{\sigma \sin \alpha}{l} - \frac{\mu(\mu - 1 + \sigma) \sin \alpha}{l \left( (\mu - 1 + \sigma)^2 + l(2(\mu - 1 + \sigma) \cos \alpha + l) \right)^{3/2}} - \frac{(1 - \mu)(\mu + \sigma) \sin \alpha}{l \left( (\mu + \sigma)^2 + l(2(\mu + \sigma) \cos \alpha + l) \right)^{3/2}}$$
(16)

This equation has the following energy integral 257

$$\frac{(\alpha')^2}{2} + W(\alpha) = E \tag{17}$$

where E is the total energy, the potential energy is 259 written as 260

$$W(\alpha) = \int F(\alpha) d\alpha$$
  
=  $-\frac{\sigma \cos \alpha}{l} - \frac{\mu}{l^2 \sqrt{l^2 + (\mu - 1 + \sigma)^2 + 2l(\mu - 1 + \sigma) \cos \alpha}}$   
 $-\frac{1 - \mu}{l^2 \sqrt{l^2 + (\mu + \sigma)^2 + 2l(\mu + \sigma) \cos \alpha}}$  (18)

Figure 2 shows the generalized force (16), the potential energy (18), and the corresponding phase portrait of the system (15).

Equating Eq. (16) to zero

$$F(\alpha_*) = 0 \tag{19}$$

leads to two types of stationary positions for 268  $\alpha \in [-\pi, \pi]$ . The stable equilibrium positions are  $\alpha_s = -\pi, 0, \pi$ , and the unstable positions in the 269 vicinity of the points are  $\alpha_{us} = \frac{\pi}{2}$  and  $\alpha_{us} = -\frac{\pi}{2}$ . At 270





the points of the stable and unstable equilibrium 271 positions, the following conditions 272

$$\left.\frac{\partial F}{\partial \alpha}\right|_{\alpha=\alpha_s} = \left.\frac{\partial^2 W}{\partial \alpha^2}\right|_{\alpha=\alpha_s} > 0, \quad \left.\frac{\partial F}{\partial \alpha}\right|_{\alpha=\alpha_{us}} = \left.\frac{\partial^2 W}{\partial \alpha^2}\right|_{\alpha=\alpha_{us}} < 0$$
(20)

are satisfied as shown in Fig. 2. Differentiating 274 Eq. (16), we have 275

Deringer

Pages : 13

🖌 DISK

□ TYPESET

262

301

$$\begin{split} \frac{\partial F}{\partial \alpha} &= \frac{\cos \alpha}{l} \left[ \sigma - \frac{\mu(\mu - 1 + \sigma)}{\left(l^2 + 2l(\mu - 1 + \sigma)\cos \alpha + (\mu - 1 + \sigma)^2\right)^{3/2}} \\ &+ \frac{(\mu - 1)(\mu + \sigma)}{\left(l^2 + 2l(\mu + \sigma)\cos \alpha + (\mu + \sigma)^2\right)^{3/2}} \right] \\ &- 3\sin^2 \alpha \left[ \frac{\mu(\mu - 1 + \sigma)}{\left(l^2 + 2l(\mu - 1 + \sigma)\cos \alpha + (\mu - 1 + \sigma)^2\right)^{5/2}} \\ &- \frac{(\mu - 1)(\mu + \sigma)}{\left(l^2 + 2l(\mu + \sigma)\cos \alpha + (\mu + \sigma)^2\right)^{5/2}} \right] \end{split}$$

Using Eqs. (17) and (18), one can find the period of oscillations of the tether by the true anomaly f relative 278 279 to the stable equilibrium position  $\alpha_s = 0$ . The initial 280 condition takes the following

$$f = 0: \quad \alpha_0 = \alpha_m, \, \alpha'_0 = 0 \tag{21}$$

282 where  $\alpha_m$  is the oscillation amplitude. According to 283 Eq. (17) and the conditions (21), the total energy is

$$P = \int_{0}^{P} \mathrm{d}f = 2 \int_{\pi-\alpha_m}^{\pi+\alpha_m} \frac{\mathrm{d}\alpha}{\sqrt{2[W(\pi+\alpha_m) - W(\alpha)]}} \quad (24)$$

To approximate the oscillation frequency of a 297 constant-length tether, Eq. (15) is given in a linearized 298 form  $(\sin \alpha \approx \alpha, \cos \alpha \approx 1)$ 299

$$\alpha'' + \omega^2 \alpha = 0 \tag{25}$$

where

$$\omega^{2} = \frac{\sigma}{l} - \frac{\mu(\mu - 1 + \sigma) \sin \alpha}{l \left( (\mu - 1 + \sigma)^{2} + l(2(\mu - 1 + \sigma) + l) \right)^{3/2}} - \frac{(1 - \mu)(\mu + \sigma)}{l \left( (\mu + \sigma)^{2} + l(2(\mu + \sigma) + l) \right)^{3/2}}$$

Assuming that the length of the tether is much 303 smaller than the distance between the primaries 304  $(l = \frac{L}{n} \ll 1)$ , the frequency of oscillation of the tether 305 is written as 306

$$\omega \approx \sqrt{\frac{d}{L} \left[ \sigma + \frac{\mu}{(-1+\mu+\sigma)^2} + \frac{-1+\mu}{(\mu+\sigma)^2} \right]} - 3 \left[ \frac{\mu}{(-1+\mu+\sigma)^3} + \frac{-1+\mu}{(\mu+\sigma)^3} \right] + 6 \frac{L}{d} \left[ \frac{\mu}{(-1+\mu+\sigma)^4} + \frac{-1+\mu}{(\mu+\sigma)^4} \right]$$
(26)

284 defined as

$$E = W(\alpha_m) \tag{22}$$

286 Obviously, the tether oscillation occurs between 287 symmetrical extreme positions of the tether  $\alpha \in [-\alpha_m, \alpha_m]$ . According to (17), the oscillation 288 289 period is determined by the equation

$$P = \int_{0}^{P} \mathrm{d}f = 2 \int_{-\alpha_{m}}^{\alpha_{m}} \frac{\mathrm{d}\alpha}{\sqrt{2[W(\alpha_{m}) - W(\alpha)]}}$$
(23)

291 As follows from Eqs. (23) and (18), the oscillation 292 period P depends on the oscillation amplitude  $\alpha_m$  and the dimensionless tether length *l*. If the tether oscil-293 294 lates relative to the position of stable equilibrium 295  $\alpha_s = \pi$ , then the oscillation period is written as

Figure 3 shows that in gravitational fields of two 307 heavy bodies in a rotating frame, the oscillation 308 frequency of the pendulum "attached" to the point L1 309



Fig. 3 Oscillation frequency (26) as a function the tether length L for the L1 libration point of the Mars-Phobos system

🖉 Springer



| Journal : Medium 11071      | Dispatch : 9-9-2021 | Pages : 13 |
|-----------------------------|---------------------|------------|
| Article No. : 6884          | □ LE                | □ TYPESET  |
| MS Code : NODY-D-21-00862R1 | 🖌 СР                | 🖌 disk     |





310 increases with the increase in length, in contrast to 311 classical mathematical pendulum, in which the fre-312 quency decreases with the increase in the length of the 313 pendulum  $(\sqrt{g/L}, \text{ where } g \text{ is the gravitational}$ 314 acceleration).

#### 315 **4** Maintaining a constant distance from body $M_2$

316 The main objective of this study is to develop a deployment mission of the tether system from the 317 318 orbiter located at the L1 point to a given distance from 319 the moon's surface, so that the end body M of the 320 tether system is in equilibrium relative to the line (local vertical) connecting the primaries  $M_1$  and  $M_2$ . 321 Consider elliptical orbits of the primaries, then due to 322 323 their eccentricity, the L1 libration point pulsates in the 324 range corresponding to the perigee (f = 0) and apogee 325  $(f = \pi)$  of their orbits. We propose to divide the whole 326 deployment mission of the tether system into three 327 successive stages (Fig. 4):

328 1. The initial (basic) deployment of the tether from 329 the L1 point to a given length, which corresponds 330 to the perigee, so that at the end point the 331 deployment rate is equal to zero (l' = dl/df = 0). 332 2. The angular stabilization of the end body relative

to the lower stable equilibrium position ( $\alpha \rightarrow 0$ ) closest to the moon's surface. The control of deployment and retrieval of the 335 tether to maintain a constant distance to the moon's surface due to pulsations of the L1 337 libration point.

Now, consider these stages of the deployment of the339tether system.340

4.1 Basic deployment of the tether 341

At this stage, the problem about deploying the tether 342 system to a given distance corresponding to perigees 343 of the orbits of the primaries is solved after the ejection 344 of the end mass from the orbiter. The deployment of 345 the tether will be provided by the tension force, 346 therefore, we rewrite the equations of motion (9) and 347 (10) taking into account this force as 348

$$\alpha'' + F_{\alpha} = 0 \tag{27}$$

$$l'' + F_l = T \tag{28} \qquad 350$$

where *T* is a dimensionless tension force.

After separation from the orbiter with an ejection 353 velocity  $V_0 = l'_0$ , it is necessary to ensure a zero 354 velocity  $V_f = l'_f = 0$ , when the tether reaches the 355 given length  $l = l_f$  at the end point. At this stage, the 356 feedback algorithm (variable linear feedback) is taken 357 as a law of tension of the tether, the effectiveness of 358

Deringer



| Journal : Medium 11071      | Dispatch : 9-9-2021 | Pages : 13 |
|-----------------------------|---------------------|------------|
| Article No.: 6884           | □ LE                | □ TYPESET  |
| MS Code : NODY-D-21-00862R1 | 🗹 СР                | 🖌 disk     |

which will be demonstrated in the simulation below.And so, the control law can be written as

$$T_1 = k_{1l}(l - l_f) + k_{1V}l'$$
(29)

362 The dimensionless coefficients  $k_{1l}$  and  $k_{1V}$  are 363 determined from the satisfaction of the final conditions

$$l = l_f, \ l'_f = 0$$
 (30)

366 4.2 Angular stabilization of the tether

365

Author Proo

367 If during the deployment of the tether in the first stage, 368 as a result of the influence of unaccounted distur-369 bances, there are significant oscillations of the tether 370 relative to the lower stable position  $\alpha_s = 0$ , then 371 stabilization is required to reduce the amplitude of the 372 oscillations before the next stage of deployment of the 373 tether. To generate a control law for the tether tension 374 force, we use the control law  $(l = l_f + \lambda \alpha' \sin \alpha)$  for a 375 pendulum with a moving mass, which provides, on 376 average, asymptotic stability of the pendulum [27], 377 and write for our case the law of the tether tension 378 force as

$$T_2 = k_{2l} \left[ l - \left( l_f + \lambda \alpha' \sin \alpha \right) \right] + k_{2V} l'$$
(31)

380 where  $k_{2l}$ ,  $k_{2V}$ ,  $\lambda$  are the control dimensionless 381 coefficients.

## 382 4.3 Maintaining a constant distance from moon's383 surface

384 The last stage of a deployment-retrieval of the tether is 385 continuous: The distance from the end body attached on the tether to the moon's surface must remain 386 387 constant. The deployment occurs when the moon 388 moves from perigee to apogee, and the retrieval takes place during the motion of the moon in the opposite 389 390 direction from apogee to perigee. And so, the tether is 391 attached at the L1 libration point and the primaries move in elliptical orbits. Let us first derive the 392 393 equation describing the change in length to ensure 394 the constant distance from the end body to the moon's 395 surface. The distance between the primaries  $M_1$  and 396  $M_2$  is determined by Eq. (1), which corresponds to the 397 Nechville's coordinates

$$\xi = 1, \ \eta = 0 \tag{32}$$

The  $L_1$  point corresponding to Eq. (7) in Nechville's coordinates is defined as 400

$$\xi_1 = \sigma, \ \eta_1 = 0 \tag{33}$$

Taking into account that L is the dimensional tether402length, and d is the dimensional distance from the403point  $M_2$  to the point where the end body should be404located on the line  $M_1M_2$ , the following equation can405be written as406

$$d + L = r(1 - \sigma) \tag{34}$$

or

$$L = r(1 - \sigma) - d \tag{35}$$

In dimensionless form, this equation is written as 410

$$l = \frac{L}{p} = \frac{1 - \sigma}{1 + e \cos f} - \delta \tag{36}$$

where  $\delta = \frac{d}{p}$  is the relative distance from the point  $M_2$  412 to the end mass. From Eq. (36), it is clear that at the apogee and at the perigee of the primaries orbits, the relative lengths of the tether are, respectively, 415

$$l_{\alpha} = \frac{1-\sigma}{1-e} - \delta, \ l_{\pi} = \frac{1-\sigma}{1+e} - \delta \tag{37}$$

where  $l_{\alpha}$ ,  $l_{\pi}$  correspond to the apogee and the perigee, 417 respectively. 418

Using Eq. (36), the tension force control law, which 419 ensures the constant distance from the end body 420 attached on the tether to the primary  $M_2$ , can be 421 represented as 422

$$T_3 = k_{3l} \left[ l - \left( \frac{1 - \sigma}{1 + e \cos f} - \delta \right) \right] + k_{3V} l'$$
(38)

424

425

408

#### 5 Numerical modeling

This section shows the effectiveness of the proposed 426 control laws at all stages of the tether system 427 deployment on the basis of numerical simulation. In 428 addition, the oscillation period and unstable positions 429 of the constant-length tether fixed at the L1 libration 430 point are numerically determined. As an example, the 431 Mars-Phobos system is considered, in which the L1 432 libration point is located quite close to the Phobos' 433 surface ( $\sim$  3.4 km). At all stages, the simulation is 434



| Journal : Medium 11071      | Dispatch : 9-9-2021 | Pages : 13 |
|-----------------------------|---------------------|------------|
| Article No. : 6884          | □ LE                | □ TYPESET  |
| MS Code : NODY-D-21-00862R1 | 🛃 СР                | 🖌 disk     |



**Fig. 5** The oscillation period for the different tether lengths L = p l



Fig. 6 The tether deployment length and the oscillation angle of the tether for the ejection velocity  $V_0$ : 1.5 m/s—blue, 2.0 m/s—red, 2.5 m/s—green

435 performed by numerical integration of Eqs. (9) and436 (10).

#### 5.1 Oscillation period of the constant-length tether 437

Figure 5 depicts the oscillation period of the tether 438 system relative to the lower stable position  $\alpha_S = 0$  439



| • | Journal : Medium 11071      | Dispatch : 9-9-2021 | Pages : 13 |
|---|-----------------------------|---------------------|------------|
|   | Article No. : 6884          | □ LE                | □ TYPESET  |
|   | MS Code : NODY-D-21-00862R1 | 🛃 СР                | 🗹 DISK     |

Deringer

440 depending on the oscillation amplitude  $\alpha_m$  of the 441 tether. Observe that the greater the oscillation amplitude of the tether, the greater the oscillation period. So 442 443 if a relatively short tether (L = 250 m) is used and its 444 oscillation amplitude is 1.05 rads, then the period of 445 oscillation is 3.2 h. For a long tether (L = 3000 m) and 446 small amplitude (0.26 rads), the period of oscillation is 447 2.1 h. At the same time, note that, the orbital period of 448 Phobos around Mars is 7.65 h.

#### 449 5.2 Main deployment of the tether

450 For this deployment stage, we investigate the influence of two factors: the velocity and direction of the tether 451 452 ejection from the orbiter, using the Mars-Fobos system as an example. The effectiveness of the control law 453 454 (29) is illustrated with simulation results on the 455 example of the Mars-Phobos system. A payload (end 456 mass) of the tether system is separated from the orbiter 457 with the ejection velocity  $V_0$ : 1.5 m/s, 2.0 m/s, 2.5 m/ 45 AQ3 s. Figure 6a, b corresponds to the initial deflection angle  $\alpha_0$  of the tether equals to 0.1 rad, and Fig. 6c, d 459 460 to 1.0 rad. The tether system parameters are taken to 461 be payload mass m = 10 kg, final tether deployment length  $L_f = p l_f = 3500 \,\mathrm{m}$ , the dimensionless coeffi-462 463 cients from Eq. (29)  $k_{1l} = -50000$ and 464  $k_{1V} = -16000$ . Figure 6b, d shows that the tether is deployed to its full length, while the angular oscilla-465 466 tions of the tether are not stabilized. In all three 467 considered cases (Fig. 5), the tether is always stretched, and the tension force of the tether does not 468 469 exceed 0.7 N.

470 As shown in Fig. 6, the ejection velocity has little
471 effect on the deployment of the tether. The situation is
472 more complicated with the direction of the ejection

velocity, since the tether can be deployed both toward 473 Phobos and toward Mars. The boundaries of these 474 areas for the ejection angle (toward Phobos or toward 475 Mars) are the points of an unstable equilibrium  $\alpha_{us}$ . In 476 the case of a circular orbit and a constant tether length, 477 these points are defined as the solution of Eq. (19). In 478 the general case, the unstable equilibrium position  $\alpha_{us}$ 479 changes depending on the tether length l, eccentricity 480 e, and true anomaly f. The unstable equilibrium 481 position ( $\alpha_{us} = 2.477$  radian) is found by selection 482 with the use of numerical simulation Eqs. (27) and 483 (28) describing the deployment of the tether. In 484 connection with the above, choose the following 485

$$\alpha_0 = 0, \ \frac{\pi}{4}, \ \frac{\pi}{2}, \ 2.477, \ \frac{3\pi}{4}, \ \pi$$
(39)

The ejection velocity is assumed to be the same for 488 all cases, equal  $\mu$   $V_0 = L'_0 = 2.0$  m/s. Figure 7a 489 demonstrates that the deployment of the tether L(f) 490 does not depend on the ejection angle  $\alpha_0$ . As follows 491 from Fig. 7b, to deploy the tether toward Phobos, the 492 ejection angle must belong to the range 493

$$\alpha_0 \in (-2.477, 2.477) \tag{40}$$

**495** 496

486

#### 5.3 Angular stabilization of the tether

ejection angles

At the second stage, angular stabilization is realized by 497 means of the control law (31). Two cases of the 498 angular stabilization of the tether are considered: 499

- the deployment of the tether toward Phobos 500 (Fig. 8), the control coefficient  $\lambda = 4 \cdot 10^{-5}$ . 501



Fig. 7 The tether deployment length and the oscillation angle of the tether for different initial ejection angles (39)

Description Springer

| <br>Journal : Medium 11071  | Dispatch : 9-9-2021 | Pages : 13 |  |
|-----------------------------|---------------------|------------|--|
| Article No. : 6884          | 🗆 LE                | □ TYPESET  |  |
| MS Code : NODY-D-21-00862R1 | 🗹 СР                | 🖌 DISK     |  |



Fig. 8 The deployment of the tether toward Phobos. a The oscillation angle  $\alpha$  and b the tether length L = p l



Fig. 9 The deployment of the tether toward Mars. **a** The oscillation angle  $\alpha$ , **b** the tether length L = p l

502 - the deployment of the tether toward Phobos 503 (Fig. 9), the control coefficient  $\lambda = -4 \cdot 10^{-5}$ .

504 At the end of the first stage, suppose that the tether oscillation amplitude  $\alpha_m$  equals to 1 rad. Figures 8 and 505 506 9 illustrate the effectiveness of the control law (31), which provides damping of angular oscillations of the 507 tether, while the tether remains stretched and the 508 509 tension force does not exceed 0.1 N for the mass of the payload equal to 10 kg and for the initial deflection 510 angle  $\alpha_0$  of the tether equal to 1.0 rad and for the initial 511 ejection velocity  $V_0 = 2.0$  m/s. 512

Figures 8 and 9 show that the angular stabilization of the tether requires much longer time than the main deployment of the tether, and the damping of tether oscillations occurs quite slowly, since according to the control law (31) as the deflection angle of the tether decreases, the control effect decreases. Although, on the other hand, it is shown in [27] that the control law519(31) provides, on average, asymptotic stability.520

5.4 Maintaining a constant distance from moon's<br/>surface521<br/>522

The stage of maintaining a constant distance to523Phobos's surface using the control law (38) starts at524the point in time when the primaries are at the perigee525of the orbits. Numerical simulations are carried out526with the following initial conditions527

$$l_0 = 0.000377378, \quad l_0 = 0, \quad \alpha_0 = 0.1 \text{ rad}, \quad (41)$$

Figure 10 shows that at perigee, the tether length is5293580 m, at apogee, it is 4090 m (a), and during one530orbital period of the primaries, the tether performs531more than four complete oscillations (b), the ampli-532tude of which varies insignificantly. Modeling in this533

Deringer





| Journal : Medium 11071      | Dispatch : 9-9-2021 | Pages : 13 |
|-----------------------------|---------------------|------------|
| Article No. : 6884          | □ LE                | □ TYPESET  |
| MS Code : NODY-D-21-00862R1 | 🗹 СР                | 🗹 disk     |



**Fig. 10** a The tether length L = p l, b the oscillation angle  $\alpha$ 

case indicates that the tether remains always stretched
and the tension force does not exceed 0.025 N for the
mass of the payload is equal 10 kg.

Thus, the numerical simulations have shown the
effectiveness of the proposed control laws of the tether
system at all stages of the mission for the Mars-Phobos
system.

#### 541 6 Conclusions

The main results and conclusions about the applicability of the proposed mission architecture, mathematical models and control laws can be summarized as
follows:

- 546 1. The deployment in three consecutive stages (main deployment, angular stabilization, and maintain548 ing a constant distance to moon's surface) has
  549 been substantiated and verified by numerical
  550 simulations.
- 551 The motion equation for a weightless and inex-2. 552 tensible tether with an end mass. The energy 553 integral of the equation and the period of tether 554 oscillation relative to the stable equilibrium posi-555 tions have been found. It has been shown that the tether can rotate or oscillate relative to the two 556 557 positions of stable equilibrium, which lie on the 558 line connecting the primaries. In addition, it has 559 been noted that in gravitational fields of two heavy 560 bodies in a rotating frame, the oscillation fre-561 quency of the pendulum "attached" to the point 562 L1 increases with increase in the length, in 563 contrast to classical mathematical pendulum, in



which the frequency decreases with increasing the564length of the pendulum.565

- The proposed control laws of the tether tension force satisfy the requirements of the each stage as shown by numerical simulations, and these control laws are characterized by simplicity.
   569
- 4. The tether deployment mission scene consisting of three consecutive phases proposed in the paper is not the only possible scene. Alternative schemas are quite possible and this may be the subject of the following works.
  574

These studies confirm the feasibility of the 575 PHLOTE mission and provide some theoretical jus-576 tification for the mission. In all likelihood, this is the 577 first analytical study of the motion of a tether system in 578 the two-body gravitational field in terms of the 579 restricted elliptic three-body problem, which comple-580 ments both the three-body problem and the tether 581 space systems problem. 582

In continuation of this study, we can consider 583 motion of the tether system, taking into account 584 motion of an orbiter in a small vicinity of the libration 585 point. In addition, the proposed approach may be 586 useful as other planet-moon systems and for other 587 collinear libration points, for example L2 libration 588 point. 589

AcknowledgementsThis study was supported by the Russian590Science Foundation (Project No. 19-19-00085).591

Data availability statementThe datasets generated during592and/or analyzed during the current study are available from the<br/>corresponding author on reasonable request.593

595

Springer



| Journal : Medium 11071      | Dispatch : 9-9-2021 | Pages : 13 |
|-----------------------------|---------------------|------------|
| Article No. : 6884          | 🗆 LE                | □ TYPESET  |
| MS Code : NODY-D-21-00862R1 | 🗹 СР                | 🖌 DISK     |

#### 596 Declarations

597 Conflict of interest The author declares that he has no conflict598 of interest.

#### 599 References

600

601

602

603

604

605

606

607

608

609

610

611

612

613

614

615

616

617

618

619

620

Author Proo

- Beletsky, V.V., Levin, E.V.: Dynamics of Space Tether Systems. Univelt Incorporated, San Diego (1993)
- Levin, E.M.: Dynamic Analysis of Space Tether Missions. Univelt Incorporated, San Diego (2007)
- Troger, H., Alpatov, A.P., Beletsky, V.V., Dranovskii, V.I., Khoroshilov, V.S., Pirozhenko, A.V., Zakrzhevskii, A.E.: Dynamics of Tethered Space Systems. CRC Press, New York (2010)
- Aslanov, V.S., Ledkov, A.S.: Dynamics of Tethered Satellite Systems. Woodhead Publishing, Cambridge (2012)
- Williams, P., Hyslop, A., Stelzer, M., Kruijff, M.: YES2 optimal trajectories in presence of eccentricity and aerodynamic drag. Acta Astronaut. 64(7), 745–769 (2009). https://doi.org/10.1016/j.actaastro.2008.11.007
- Williams, P., Blanksby, C., Trivailo, P.: Tethered planetary capture maneuvers. J. Spacecr. Rocket. 41(4), 603–613 (2004). https://doi.org/10.2514/1.1024
- Jung, W., Mazzoleni, A.P., Chung, J.: Nonlinear dynamic analysis of a three-body tethered satellite system with deployment/retrieval. Nonlinear Dyn 82, 1127–1144 (2015). https://doi.org/10.1007/s11071-015-2221-z
- 8. Huang, P., Zhang, F., Chen, L., et al.: A review of space tether in new applications. Nonlinear Dyn 94, 1–19 (2018).
  https://doi.org/10.1007/s11071-018-4389-5
- 9. Yu, B.S., Xu, S.D., Jin, D.P.: Chaos in a tethered satellite
  system induced by atmospheric drag and Earth's oblateness.
  Nonlinear Dyn 101, 1233–1244 (2020). https://doi.org/10.
  1007/s11071-020-05844-8
- 10. Ledkov, A., Aslanov, V.: Evolution of space tethered system's orbit during space debris towing taking into account the atmosphere influence. Nonlinear Dyn 96, 2211–2223 (2019). https://doi.org/10.1007/s11071-019-04918-6
- 11. Kumar, K.D., Kumar, K.: Attitude maneuver of dual tethered satellite platforms through tether offset change.
  J. Spacecr. Rocket. 38(2), 237–242 (2001). https://doi.org/ 10.2514/2.3676
- Kumar, K., Yasaka, T.: Rotation formation flying of three
  satellites using tethers. J. Spacecr. Rocket. 41(6), 973–985
  (2004). https://doi.org/10.2514/1.14251
- 639
   13. Cartmell, M.P., McKenzie, D.J.: A review of space tether research. Prog. Aerosp. Sci. 44(1), 1–21 (2008). https://doi. org/10.1016/j.paerosci.2007.08.002
- 642 14. Mashayekhi, M.J., Misra, A.K.: Optimization of tether-assisted asteroid deflection. J. Guid. Control. Dyn. 37(3), 898–906 (2014). https://doi.org/10.2514/1.60176

- 15. Aslanov, V.S., Ledkov, A.S., Misra, A.K., Guerman, A.D.:
  Dynamics of space elevator after tether rupture. J. Guid.
  Control. Dyn. 36(4), 986–992 (2013). https://doi.org/10.
  2514/1.59378
- 16. Kempton, K., Pearson, J., Levin, E., Carroll, J., Amzajerdian, F.: Phase 1 Study for the Phobos L1 Operational Tether Experiment (PHLOTE). End Report, NASA, pp.1–91. https://ntrs.nasa.gov/search.jsp?R=20190000916 (2018).
  17. Sun, G., Zhu, Z.: Fractional-order tension control law for 654
- Sun, G., Zhu, Z.: Fractional-order tension control law for deployment of space tether system. J. Guid. Control. Dyn. 37(6), 2057–2167 (2014). https://doi.org/10.2514/1. G000496

655

656

657

658

659

660

661

662

663

669

670

671

672

673

674

675

676

677

678

679

680

681

682

683

684

685

686

687

- Yu, B., Jin, D., Wen, H.: Nonlinear dynamics of flexible tethered satellite system subject to space environment. Appl. Math. Mech. Engl. Ed. **37**, 485–500 (2016). https:// doi.org/10.1007/s10483-016-2049-9
- 19. Szebehely, V.: The Restricted Problem of Three Bodies. Academic Press Inc., New York (1967)
- 20. Luo, T., Pucacco, G., Xu, M.: Lissajous and halo orbits in A04 64 the restricted three-body problem by normalization method. Nonlinear Dyn 101, 2629–2644 (2020). https://doi.org/10. 666 1007/s11071-020-05875-1 667
  21. Zotos, E.E.: Classifying orbits in the restricted three-body 668
- Zotos, E.E.: Classifying orbits in the restricted three-body problem. Nonlinear Dyn 82, 1233–1250 (2015). https://doi. org/10.1007/s11071-015-2229-4
- 22. Ferrari, F., Lavagna, M.: Periodic motion around libration points in the elliptic restricted three-body problem. Nonlinear Dyn **93**, 453–462 (2018). https://doi.org/10.1007/ s11071-018-4203-4
- 23. Woo, P., Misra, A.K.: Equilibrium points in the full threebody problem. Acta Astronaut. 99, 158–165 (2014). https:// doi.org/10.1016/j.actaastro.2014.02.019
- Biggs, J.D., Negri, A.: Orbit-attitude control in a circular restricted three-body problem using distributed reflectivity devices. J. Guid. Control. Dyn. 42(12), 2712–2721 (2019). https://doi.org/10.2514/1.G004493
- Alessi, E.M., Sánchez, J.P.: Semi-analytical approach for distant encounters in the spatial circular restricted threebody problem. J. Guid. Control. Dyn. **39**(2), 351–359 (2016). https://doi.org/10.2514/1.G001237
- 26. Markeev, A.P.: Libration Points in Celestial Mechanics and Astrodynamics. Nauka, Moscow (1978).. (in Russian)
- 27. Aslanov, V.S.: Stability of a pendulum with a moving mass: the averaging method. J. Sound Vib. 445, 261–269 (2019). https://doi.org/10.1016/j.jsv.2019.01.021

**Publisher's Note** Springer Nature remains neutral with regard to jurisdictional claims in published maps and institutional affiliations.



| Journal : Medium 11071      | Dispatch : 9-9-2021 | Pages : 13 |
|-----------------------------|---------------------|------------|
| Article No. : 6884          | □ LE                | □ TYPESET  |
| MS Code : NODY-D-21-00862R1 | 🗹 СР                | 🗹 disk     |

Journal : **11071** Article : **6884** 

### Author Query Form

## Please ensure you fill out your response to the queries raised below and return this form along with your corrections

Dear Author

During the process of typesetting your article, the following queries have arisen. Please check your typeset proof carefully against the queries listed below and mark the necessary changes either directly on the proof/online grid or in the 'Author's response' area provided below

| Query | Details Required   | Author's Response |
|-------|--|-------------------|
| AQ1   | Kindly check and confirm the street information is correct for affiliation.  |                   |
| AQ2   | Please check whether the intended meaning of the sentence 'The classical equations in their mass center' is clearly conveyed.  |                   |
| AQ3   | As per the information provided by the publisher, Fig. 6 will be black and white in print; hence, please confirm whether we can add "colour figure online" to the caption. |                   |
| AQ4   | As References [20] and [21] are same, we have deleted the duplicate reference and renumbered accordingly. Please check and confirm.  |                   |